

CITY OPPOSES TWINING SUBSTITUTE TRANSIT PROGRAM—DEMANDS THE TAYLOR PLAN

MAYOR ANNOUNCES HE WILL NAME TRANSIT COMMISSION

Continued from Page One

Plans for the extension of the high-speed transit system and the suggestion that the fare be increased to 5 1/2 or 6 cents were voted today by the leaders in business and civic organizations and others who have been active for months in the fight for the adoption of the Taylor plan.

While the entire program of Director Twining was denounced as being only an unemancipated hobnob substitute for the comprehensive system worked out by former Director Taylor, the local tax and the fare increase phases of the Twining plan were condemned in particular.

Called Breach of Faith. The proposal to construct only the trunk lines at the present time and to postpone building all the spurs until some indefinite future was condemned as a breach of faith with the people of those sections who voted for the \$6,000,000 transit loan last year in the belief that they were to be directly benefited.

The very complexity of the Twining report, with its mass of technical problems, it was admitted by all, would postpone direct criticism until careful study could be given to the various details of the new proposals.

TRANSIT LEAGUE AROUSED. The All-Philadelphia Rapid Transit League, which was organized two months ago, when it was first intimated that the Smith administration intended to tear pieces the Taylor plan, announced today through Horace V. MacFadyen, the president, that it would take a stand in the city against the Twining proposals.

First. Constructed by a series of progressive steps from the center of the city toward the suburbs. Second. Local assessments for the construction of the spurs beyond the 25-minute street car zone from City Hall.

Third. Cost of high-speed lines and their support anti-profit-producing to be borne by the city, instead of an indirect tax on real estate. This would mean a carfare above 5 cents until 1920, under the estimate of Director Twining.

Fourth. Specific changes in the construction program, including the change from a four-track to a two-track subway at City Hall, the relocation of the station there, the substitution of the Ridge avenue leg of the loop for the Arch street leg, minor changes on the southern leg of the loop, and a raised loop in location of the Darby elevated line.

SUGGESTIONS BY TWINING. The report urges the following: The immediate construction of the bottlenecks in Broad street from Spruce street to Erie avenue or Pike street. This section, Twining estimates will cost \$18,490,000 and can be in operation by 1920 if work be begun promptly.

to exceed 5 1/2 cents, beginning in 1921, which will be reduced gradually until 1930, or that the alternative of a 12 per cent. increase in the tax rate be adopted.

LINES IN DETAIL. Under the Twining plan the various lines would be built as follows: Subway, four tracks from Pike street south to Ridge avenue and two tracks south to Spruce street. Cost, \$18,490,000. To be built by city. Ready for operation in 1920. Equipment to be furnished by lessee.

Subway, two tracks, from Broad street under Ridge avenue, under 10th street, under Walnut street to 16th street. To be built by city at cost of \$7,500,000. Ready for operation by 1920. Equipment to be furnished by lessee.

Subway-elevated, to be built by city at future date, Parkway, 29th street to Hunting Park avenue; cost, \$4,200,000. Equipment to be furnished by lessee. Extensions: To Roxborough, costing \$1,800,000, and to Germantown, costing \$2,100,000, at later date with funds raised by local assessment.

Chestnut street line: Considered but not definitely recommended unless an operating agreement could be secured with the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company. Camden tube: Recommended built by independent company and leased to P. R. T. Company.

The total cost of all the lines, with the exception of the Chestnut street subway and the Camden tube, under the Twining plan, would be \$59,200,000. A number of points in the Taylor transit plan Director Twining regards as defects or at least as unwise. Summarized from their presentation in the report they are:

The undertaking of the whole construction program at once during an era of abnormally high prices and before an operating agreement for the system has been worked out. The financing entirely by city funds of all construction of branches, and in outlying sections where the traffic does not immediately warrant such outlay.

The diversion from the city treasury of money to pay for the deficits in interest and sinking fund charges on city bonds issued to pay for the new construction. The location of certain lines and stations in the city district and the method of routing trains.

The proposal for a universal 5-cent fare at this time. The proposal that the city shall transfer all excess cost of service over the revenue derived from a 5-cent fare to the real estate taxes of the city, up to the full cash requirements of its bonded interest and sinking fund.

The two latter features of the Taylor plan Director Twining holds are fallacious in principle and socialistic in theory. A recognition of the fact that City Councils shall determine when and where high-speed lines be built and how they shall be financed. This proposal Director Twining regards as dangerous because it recognizes a potential control of what is a highly complex business problem in transportation.

Mayor for Subway in Four Years and for Delay Plan

Mayor Smith, in two separate statements, last night declared the subway will be built the entire length of Broad street, that \$50,000,000 will be spent on rapid transit during the next four years, that the Department of City Transit should be abolished and that it should be replaced with a Commission on Transit. The Mayor made these statements:

At the flower dinner at Horticultural Hall: We are going to dig up Broad street from end to end. We expect to spend \$50,000,000 in the next four years on a rapid transit system for Philadelphia that will not be equaled in any city in the world.

After the Finance Committee meeting of Councils: When I heard Director Twining's report on transit this afternoon, I felt convinced there should be a commission to handle the development of our transit plans. The present arrangement permits too much responsibility to devolve upon one man's shoulders.

The burden is too great. We are in the midst of a great project, requiring a caution, care and the benefit of more than one man's experience. A Commission on Transit is what we should have, and not a Department of Transit.

where many factors in the problem are external to the city and not in its control, there may well be city aid in its development. "The transit problem, however, is an internal problem, of local interest only—a matter of local transportation wholly within the city's control and containing within itself all the means needed for its solution. No financial aid need be extended by the city if the public insistence upon the 5-cent fare be temporarily abandoned.

"As shown elsewhere in this report, should the comprehensive system be built at a cost of, say, \$60,000,000 and be in operation in 1921, as per plan No. 16 of the 1915 annual report of the Department of City Transit, under the terms assumed, the resulting carfare is estimated to be about 5.53 cents, which is about 8 per cent. higher than the present fare of 5.156 cents, or 12 per cent. higher than the ideal 5-cent fare.

"If the 'progressive step' program, heretofore outlined, be adopted, Nos. 1 and 2 be in use in 1921, under the same assumptions, the fare required has been estimated at 5.30 cents—about 3 per cent. increase above the present fare.

"All propositions heretofore submitted have been on the assumption that under the lease of these lines to the Philadelphia Rapid Transit Company the city would assume all excess fare over 5 cents up to the limit of full interest and sinking fund on the bonds issued for the construction of the lines, thereby paying about 12 per cent. of the carfare of the riders in 1921.

"Provision should be made in the lease for the corresponding increase in the city tax portion of the fare as more lines are added. It should be understood that the figures just given are for illustrating the principle only. The portion of the fare representing the city's tax is levied to meet the interest on bonds issued to pay for the new rapid transit lines. It should be collected by the lessee and turned into the city's treasury exactly as in the case of the lease of the city's gas works. This tax should produce the revenue needed to meet the city's obligations.

The Director then declares that a seductive feature of the present financial plans for the construction of the rapid transit lines is found in the proposal to issue city bonds under the provisions of the recent act providing for a life of 50 years, the payment of the interest and sinking fund charges during the period of construction, and one year thereafter, out of the proceeds of the bonds themselves, and a gradual sinking fund—all features expected and intended to place as much of the burden as possible on posterity. The seductive feature is in the fact that the burden will not be realized until possibly four years after the lines are authorized.

LOCAL TAX SUGGESTION. An idea entirely new to this city for financing transit development, especially development in the suburban districts, is advanced by the Director. It is simply the proposition that outlying districts, or sections which obtain elevated or subway advantages, shall be forced to pay for them by extra taxation or assessment. He advocates new legislation to this effect.

"The chief benefits resulting from the construction of rapid transit lines will accrue to two zones of the city: (a) The business district, which may here be defined as the district contained within a one-mile radius drawn from 11th and Market streets; and (b) the districts lying outside of a circle drawn with a radius of four miles from the same point. The middle zone lying between the first and four-mile circles will probably be affected very little by these lines and only along the lines themselves.

"As all estimates of growth of population in Philadelphia show that within 50 years or less the population in Philadelphia proper and the vicinity will exceed 3,000,000, and inasmuch as the available land now lying within the four-mile circle is practically all developed, excepting such business areas as the University City and the University City district, the future growth will be largely distributed over the area outside of the four-mile limit, and in this district will occur the greatest rise in land value.

"The district lying between the one- and three-mile circles will receive comparatively little direct benefit from the building and operation of these lines, but there is no doubt that the future growth of this section of the city out of the calculation, as this land is already improved and fairly well served now by the present surface car system. Actually this zone should carry an amount of the burden, and that part only on the section lying along and benefiting by the lines.

"While the rapid transit lines will draw some business from the territory inside of the four-mile circle, they must be considered in that zone as trunk lines or channels connecting the residential district with the business district, and not built primarily to serve the intermediate district, consequently these form the main and terminal sections of the system, and may, therefore, be paid for by general bond issue."

THE INQUIRER. The Inquirer condemns the Twining plan absolutely. It says, editorially: Director Twining has produced his much-talked-of plans. They are both tall plans. They are drawn not in the interests of the public, but in the interests of the Rapid Transit Company.

THE INQUIRER. The Inquirer condemns the Twining plan absolutely. It says, editorially: Director Twining has produced his much-talked-of plans. They are both tall plans. They are drawn not in the interests of the public, but in the interests of the Rapid Transit Company.

THE INQUIRER. The Inquirer condemns the Twining plan absolutely. It says, editorially: Director Twining has produced his much-talked-of plans. They are both tall plans. They are drawn not in the interests of the public, but in the interests of the Rapid Transit Company.

THE INQUIRER. The Inquirer condemns the Twining plan absolutely. It says, editorially: Director Twining has produced his much-talked-of plans. They are both tall plans. They are drawn not in the interests of the public, but in the interests of the Rapid Transit Company.

TWINING TRANSIT PLAN NOT INDORSED BY ANY NEWSPAPER IN CITY

Two Rap It, One Slurs It and Three Other Editors Argue Against It Mildly

TAYLOR IDEAS DROPPED

None of the five Philadelphia morning papers indorses the transit plan of Director Twining. Two of them rap it heartily, one slurs it and two others argue against it mildly. The Evening Bulletin also says the substitute plan will not do.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

THE PUBLIC LEDGER. In its editorial the PUBLIC LEDGER says: It is important to notice, that while Director Twining would compel the outgoing section to wait for transit facilities until the city can be authorized to assess the costs upon them, he makes no such condition apply to the Frankford elevated line.

ago has further complicated the situation. The views now presented by the Director will add to the difficulty of forming a correct judgment.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

ago has further complicated the situation. The views now presented by the Director will add to the difficulty of forming a correct judgment.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.

THE EVENING BULLETIN. The Evening Bulletin, calling the transit plans unacceptable, says editorially: Director Twining's recommendation as to the rapid transit problem, for which the people have been kept waiting many weeks, serve chiefly to create confusion and cause delay, and to the majority of the citizens and will serve only to strengthen the demand of the public upon Mayor Smith and Councils that work on the Taylor plan, under contracts awarded, shall be resumed and pressed to completion with the least possible waste of time.



CLUPECO HANDKERCHIEFS after having been washed and ironed, are very carefully inspected—none but perfect ones are put up in the germ-proof packages for delivery to you. The cleanest factory, the cleanest operators, the cleanest methods, naturally mean the cleanest handkerchiefs. Four Qualities—10c each, 3 for 25c 2 for 25c and 25c each. Made at the Arrow Collar Factory at Troy, N. Y., by CLUETT, PEABODY & CO., Inc.

WHITE Custom Built. IT is significant that for years past, none of the highest priced cars in this country have made any radical change in the type of their engine nor lowered their price. Conservatism in design and stability of value are marked characteristics of quality. They appeal to a class of owners who will pay the price of unfailing luxurious service and demand that it be proof against complication or experiment. The White is a conservative product. Innovations have never been permitted to complicate its well known performance, nor price to limit the refinement of its custom-made body. 'Thirty' Touring Car, \$2700. 'Forty-Five' Touring Car, \$3800. THE WHITE COMPANY, Cleveland. PHILADELPHIA 216-220 North Broad Street.

H&M Easter is less than a month distant. Little time enough to order Spring clothes, but sufficient to insure careful fit and construction by the most skilled of master tailors. A few minutes given to selection and measurements now will insure against disappointment and delay later on. HUGHES & MÜLLER TAILORS 1527 WALNUT ST.

STEP PIANOS. Admirably conceived, faithfully executed—the foremost example of real musical quality at a moderate price—the most active competitor of pianos sold at a half more. Pianos, \$275 to \$350; Player-Pianos, \$450 to \$800. TODAY—Hear the Edison Diamond-Disc Phonograph in our private rooms. NESTETSON & CO. 1113 CHESTNUT

Fashionable Footwear For the Young Lady. Styles specialized for the growing foot. White Calif. Boots are now the smartest feminine footwear mode. This last-inch model is particularly graceful, with a white ivory heel and white sole. Sizes 3 1/2 to 7. AA to D, also fashioned in pearl grey or Havana brown. Such a boot appeals to the young girl who wants daintiness combined with a quality for service. If you are looking for style forecast in footwear, our new models are now on display. Shoes and Hosiery 1204-06-08 Market St.