

Democratic Watchman

Terms, \$2.00 a Year, in Advance.

Bellefonte, Pa., February 7, 1890.

P. GRAY MEEK, - - - Editor.

At the Foot of the Gallows!

ANDREWS GUILTY OF THE MOST ATROCIOUS CRIME EVER COMMITTED IN CENTRE COUNTY.

He Makes a Confession.

Testimony and Proceedings Since Adjournment of Court Thursday Jan. 30.

FRIDAY MORNING.

Court opened at 9 o'clock, with the usual large crowd in attendance. The prisoner Andrews was brought in, with the look of hopefulness that characterized him during the trial.

Upon being recalled Michael Karstetter said that he had met Andrews about a mile and a half from Boak's; reached Boak's at 9.35, having passed Andrews ten or fifteen minutes before.

Mrs. Ellen Watson testified that she lived on the road between Snow Shoe and Karthaus, a mile on this side of the river, her house being on the left hand side of the road going toward the river.

On the morning of the murder saw Clara Price and the prisoner pass; it was half past nine; after she passed the man passed; he was dressed in a grayish suit and black derby hat; she pointed out the prisoner as the man she saw pass that morning; both were on the same side of the road; he was about 15 yards behind Clara; saw them 100 yards apart after they had passed, but he had not caught up to her; was standing in front of house; knew it was after 9 o'clock because she looked at the clock as soon as she went into the house; did not see any one else pass the house, but heard that a dark complected man had passed that morning.

Reuben Holt testified that on the morning of the 27th of November he was working at Moyer's job about a mile from pike; his brother and Victor Bluebell were working with him, when the prisoner came to the place at 11.30, coming from the direction of Levy's fields; he was alone and spoke to brother about work and asked me the way to Karthaus where he said he would go and get his dinner. About half an hour after he came back, while we were eating dinner, and asked the way back to Boak's; he didn't stop, but walked on slowly, and didn't ask for any thing to eat; dinner bell was ringing when he came there the first time; asked brother about work and a chance at Smith's job; in directing him to Karthaus I pointed quarterly to old road; he started back on road he had come; guess it was twenty minutes or half an hour when he came back; from where I was I could walk to the river in 20 minutes; a peddler came to me about five minutes before peddler came, he didn't stop for dinner; it was between 8 and 9 o'clock; John Gaines came the same road; he was a small man with dark complexion and light mustache.

Redmond Holt swore that he was working with his brother that morning on Moyer's job, and he corroborated his brother's testimony about Andrew's appearing at the job; when prisoner left second time he went towards Andrew Walker's; peddler went same road that Andrews did.

Arthur Graham's testimony related to Andrews' appearance at Moyer's job, and that he gave him the direction to Boak's store.

Theodore Cramer and Philip Morris gave similar testimony, stating how Andrews came to the job about the time they were eating dinner and inquired for the road to Snow Shoe.

Thomas Smith swore that while on the morning of November 27th he was working for Benner and Walker he met Andrews at the end of Walker's lane, who wanted to know the nearest place out to the public road; walked with him some 350 steps and gave him the proper directions.

Edmund Midlam in his testimony stated that on the morning of November 27th he was at his home on the road from Boak's store to Belford, which is between Moyer's camp and the butter-milk road, and the prisoner came there between 12 and 1 o'clock, and asked how far it was to the main road; he did not stop but walked right along; Oscar Midlam's testimony was to about the same effect.

Mrs. M. E. Shope testified that she lives at Gorton Heights west of Snow Shoe and that about 4 or 4.30 on the afternoon of the 27th of November Andrews came to her house and asked to stay all night and for something to eat; gave him a lunch but could not keep him; he said he came from Karthaus and was going home to Houtzdale.

Geo. M. Wyke, telegraph operator, who boarded with Mrs. Shope, testified to the same effect.

Alexander Smith, living at Well's Run, Clearfield county, testified how Andrews on the morning of November 28th came to his house and stayed for

breakfast, left after breakfast in the direction of Munson's.

Edward Pooler, sworn. Said he lived at Brisbin. Andrews lived in his house shortly before the murder. Didn't see him for some days until the Friday evening after the murder; said he had been towards Lock Haven for some money; said he had heard of the murder that day and that they were hunting for the man who had done it; said he felt curious about the murder as he had been in that neighborhood; said that he didn't catch up with the girl; that the peddler went on to Karthaus and he turned off to the left of the road when she had got to the turn of the road.

William McCann, of Philipsburg, a reporter for the Journal of that place, testified that he had met Andrews in Brisbin before his arrest and he volunteered the information concerning his movements at the time when Clara Price was murdered, the circumstances of which have been detailed in other testimony.

H. W. Zell, telegraph operator at Karthaus, testified that he heard Andrews describe his trip to Karthaus and back, after his arrest. He said he saw two little girls by whom he could prove where he turned off the pike which would make him innocent of the murder; he asked me if any one said they saw him kill her.

Thomas Pitts, track foreman at Karthaus, testified to hearing shots at about 10 o'clock on the morning of November 27th; from where he was to where the body was found is about one-half mile.

Harry Simlar, police officer of Philipsburg, testified to having assisted in arresting Andrews at Brisbin and gave the particulars substantially the same as in preliminary hearing; when taken to Burn's hotel he asked me to go out to the water-closet with him and asked what evidence they had against him; he said he knew Clara Price; asked about getting a lawyer; said he had no witnesses and no money, and guessed he would have to stand it; gave an account of his movements before and after the murder; went to Karthaus and back, left Brisbin on Tuesday at 10 a. m., rode to Philipsburg; from there to Gordon Heights and stayed all night at Mrs. Fox's; passed down the pike to Boak's store and turned off to log job, and not getting work returned back to Boak's, and from there home, returning home on Thursday afternoon; he said he hoped the two little girls he met below Boak's store on the pike had seen him; they were going towards school house; that he had asked for work at two different log jobs and was refused; he turned around and came back the way he went into lumber camp; that a peddler was there when he was.

Col. Amos Mullin testified to the statement Andrews made to him after his arrest which was substantially the same as made to Capt. Simlar and others.

John C. Henderson, county Commissioner, testified to statement made by Andrews to him, similar to the above. Sheriff Cooke also testified to conversation with prisoner. One day heard he was sick, went to his cell to see him, when Andrews spoke up and said he would have to hang as he had followed the girl down the road; he said he was bound to hang; told him if he wanted to make a statement I would get some one; sent for Mr. Reeder to come by Deputy Sheriff, but don't know if Mr. Reeder came or not.

Frank Condit, of Karthaus, swore that last spring he worked with Andrews putting in a monkey drift; at that time he had a revolver; didn't see him have it in his hands; it was in his coat pocket; asked him if he wasn't afraid to work alone; said that he had something in his pocket that would bark; did not look at revolver and could not say what caliber it was.

Noies Zimmerman and Lewis Green, peddlers who were on the road and in the vicinity at the time of the murder, testified as to their movements and whereabouts at that time. Abe Seeman, of Lock Haven, another peddler, testified that on the 27th of November left Belford and came to Karthaus, crossing river at 10 or 10.30 a. m. to Centre county side; was directed to Walker's by way of a path which I took; left Belford when children were going to school; it was half past 8 at least; stopped but 5 minutes at Karthaus a little after 10 a. m.; never walked that path before and never went from Boak's store on pike to Karthaus; met no lady on the road.

John Gaines, the person who was seen in the neighborhood on the day of the murder, testified to his movements at that time. I live in West Keating township, Clinton county; left home and went to hunt work the day before the murder; crossed pike beyond Boak's and went to George Smith's camp where I spent the night; started for Moyer's camp next morning about 7; got light when I came out on the pike; looked at my watch after I left the Moyer men and it was then after 8 or almost 9 a. m.; I went across the old fields to Moyer's job; went through the pines; was there nearly an hour; didn't come back the same way; borrowed the money to cross the river which was a quar-

ter of a mile distant; went back home; this was about 2 in the afternoon; heard of the murder at Sam Moore's about 4 or 5 o'clock that evening.

Robert Askey testified to Gaines' staying with him all night. Mitchell Watson swore that he directed Gaines the way to Moyer's camp after 8 a. m., the morning of the murder. Theodore Lanigan swore he saw Gaines at Moyer's job between 8 and 9; he stayed there 15 or 20 minutes and then went toward Bellwood. Thomas Mann testified that he saw John Gaines at Bellwood at 10 a. m. on the morning of the 27th of November.

After producing a number of other witnesses testifying to immaterial points, the commonwealth closed its evidence.

EVIDENCE FOR THE DEFENSE.

On Saturday morning Mr. Chambers opened on the side of the defense. He animadverted upon the weak showing made by the prosecution and criticised the unreliability of the maps produced by Commonwealth. He said that the defense would prove that it would have been impossible for Andrews to have been there at the time of the murder.

Wm. McCann of Philipsburg, Robert Peck, of Lock Haven, C. F. Mann, of Lock Haven, John S. Bush, of Karthaus and John H. Wolf, of Brisbin, testified that they knew Andrews before the murder and that his reputation as a peaceable man was good. Similar testimony was given by Edward Pooler in whose house he had lived in Brisbin, and by Miss Mary Pooler. Geo. Hodollar and W. Mitchell Watson both knew him and testified that they never saw or heard anything bad about him; had met him frequently. Esq. Rankin, of Karthaus, swore he knew Andrews and never heard anything bad about him.

John Wolf testified that he helped to arrest Andrews; he made no resistance; searched the prisoner's clothing and found no weapons; afterwards searched the house thoroughly; there were pots on the stove which we examined for the revolver, but found nothing but chicken in them; I saw chicken on the stove cooking.

Mrs. Andrews, wife of the prisoner, was then sworn. After stating where they had lived before they came to Brisbin, she said when her husband left home Tuesday morning he told her he was going to Lock Haven to collect some money and if he could get a good job he would take it. When he returned home on Thursday he didn't look any different than before he left. Saturday he had on button shoes which she identified in Court. Saturday evening Alfred killed a chicken so we could have it for dinner on Sunday. He did not own a revolver; some two years ago he got a revolver from my father; he was to trade it off on rags for father; I carried it for some time and Mr. Roup has it now at Karthaus; a man came to me and showed me a pistol and asked me if it was like Alfred's and I told him Alfred had no pistol. She described the clothing Andrews had on when he returned home on Thursday noon from Karthaus; took his shoes off in the evening and put them under the stove pipe; I put the shoes on the stairway; wore his coarse shoes on Friday; on Saturday morning put the buttoned shoes on and had them on all day; didn't say that my husband put the button shoes off when he came home and never put them on again; when Alfred had father's revolver he was buying rags and scrap iron; he had no revolver since last spring when he was working at the drift. Other points of testimony she gave was of an immaterial character.

Hon. J. W. Merry, of Beech Creek, Clinton county, testified that he knew Andrews since 1886; he was a servant about the house; his reputation was first-rate. Geo. Runnion, hotel keeper, of Lock Haven, also testified to his good character.

ANDREWS' EVIDENCE.

The most interesting testimony on Saturday was that of Andrews who appeared upon the stand to testify in his own behalf. He said that he was 22 years old, that he was born in the county of Cornwall, England, which country he had left when he was 17 years old; had been learning the millwright trade before he came to this country; landed at New York and came on to Altoona where he worked for Dr. Baker mining coal; afterwards worked for Peck at Lock Haven; went from there to John Roan's in West Keating, Clinton county, where he only staid two days; then worked at Castanea driving team; then went to McKean county and from there to Pittsburg; then went back to Lock Haven and got \$5 that was due him there, and from there went to Karthaus and worked in the mines for Mr. Speer. Was married on the 8th of March in Emporium, Cameron county, Pa.; went there because I couldn't get married in Karthaus. Had no license and didn't know the Squire that married me. Left Emporium the next day and came back to Karthaus; was informed I could be married by a justice of the peace without a license; was acquainted with Mrs. Andrews 3 or 4 months; didn't know my wife was married before I married her; didn't know she had a

child to her first husband, Mr. Sharp; the one she has now is mine. Worked at mining at Snow Shoe for 3 months and then went by the pike back to Karthaus, and worked there until I left for Brisbin, leaving Karthaus because the drift I was working in was stopped. I then went to Brisbin to get outside work; worked at mines at Brisbin until there was a lookout and then worked a few weeks on reservoir at Houtzdale, and then drove team for Weathers and afterwards for Pooler; expected to go to Lock Haven on Vanderbilt road; had stopped at Smith's camp a year or so ago and stayed one day but didn't get work. As I wanted to get the money that John McCloud owed me at Castanea I left Brisbin on Tuesday, November 27th between 8 and 10 a. m.; rode on freight to Osceola and walked to Philipsburg; stayed a short time and heard some one speak of a log job about 3 miles from Karthaus; got on a pusher on Beech Creek railroad and rode to Gordon Heights and then walked to Snow Shoe Summit; then rode with a man in a wagon past Giltenton going as far as the cross roads. Stopped all night at Mrs. Crofts; she told me her husband was working on the Sandy. After breakfast left Croft's at about 1 o'clock, looked at my watch when I left; passed a church and a large barn on the left side of the road; met several parties, one a young man at a water trough, and the next man I saw was sweeping a pavement in front of a big house on the right hand side of the road. I don't remember telling any one that I turned off the pike at Boak's; I said I went down the road from Boak's about a mile or more and came the same way. Met the stage with two bay horses and three men in it near Boak's store. Near Boak's store saw two little girls. I turned off the right hand road, and as I passed a church on the right side and a barn I thought I must be on the wrong road. Saw an old road leading from a saw mill, followed path as long as I could see it, got bewildered and got off the path and after wandering around I saw three men working at a log job; asked for work but they told me there was no chance for work as the job was full. Then asked for the direction of Karthaus as I wanted to get dinner; after walking a quarter of a mile I found I had no money for crossing the river, and I came back, passing the men who were eating their dinner and they directed me out to the main road. Met Mr. Smith and as I was never on this road before he showed me the way out. Met some men coming from house to barn and a man in a wagon. Asked how far it was to Boak's store, came on the road at Boak's and from there went to Snow Shoe Summit, staying in the depot for about half an hour; while trying to cross on a board raft fell into the creek; then took the railroad track and walked to Gordon Heights where I staid at coke ovens over night, next morning took breakfast at a place called Black Bear and from there went straight home where I arrived on Thursday; did nothing on Friday, but worked a half a day on Saturday, wearing my heavy working shoes; put buttoned shoes on in the afternoon from which I had cut off one of the soles between Summit and Gordon Heights on my way home; killed a chicken with a hatchet on Saturday night and didn't know there was blood on my shoes; I suppose it must be chicken blood. My little boy often played with the shoes. When I was arrested on Sunday I told them what clothes and shoes I had worn on the trip. I told Simlar I wanted him to get the shoes, as I wanted to look just the same as I did when I was in Karthaus. I was frightened when I was arrested, and when in the lock-up in Philipsburg they wanted me to make statements; also when in jail they wanted me to say that I killed Clara Price, but I never killed Clara Price.

In his cross-examination he said that when he left Mrs. Croft's where he staid all night, he passed a church and a large barn on the left side of the road, but he didn't remember telling any one that he turned off the pike at Boak's store, he didn't think he said he went into log camp and came back the same way, but that he went down the road from Boak's about a mile or more and came back the same way. He went in, and coming back the same way turned down the pike towards Karthaus, when he met two hunters and a dog. Saw a lady in the road before he came to houses some 30 rods ahead; didn't overtake her and didn't see her very long; told Pooler I saw girls and a lady along the road, but didn't think I told Pooler I knew Clara Price; I probably would have known her. I didn't inquire the way to Moyer's camp of the lady because I was a stranger and was not disposed to ask her on that account. When I turned off pike and took the path over the hill I wandered around where the path because it had grown dim, but at last struck it and it led me to the men making timber; struck it about half a mile from where I found the three men. Peddler came there after I did and came the same way; I was there 15 or 20 minutes and recognized here as witnesses the men I saw there. Told them I

wanted to go to Karthaus for dinner; left path I came in on my left and went as far as the run, but then remembering I had no money to pay my fare across the river, I returned and asked my way out to main road. I meant the Snow Shoe pike when I asked for main road; didn't know I was going away from pike. If I had got a job at Moyer's would have borrowed the money and crossed the river at Karthaus. Thomas Smith showed me the way out to the main road, walking with me some distance; didn't say to him that I had worked at Smith's job, but told him I tried to get work there. Went out and got on pike at Boak's store where I first went in. Have no recollection of seeing any one after I got on pike. Never told Capt. Mullen and Henderson that where I came out on the pike was two miles from Boak's store. I didn't feel like eating because I was too tired and besides I wanted to get home to my work. Will not say positive I told Mr. Smith that I was going to Clearfield for work. I thought I could get work at Munson's mill, but could not get any there. When at Moyer's camp I asked about Smith's job but they told me they had 60 men and needed no more. I never told any one that I cut the sole off my shoe while going towards Karthaus, but said I had done it when returning home.

To Judge Furst's question, "did you recognize the lady on the road as Clara Price," Andrews answered "I did not," and upon the Judge asking him to describe the one he saw, he said, "she had on a black hat and was not carrying a basket."

After several other witnesses were examined, whose testimony in valued no points of interest or importance, the evidence in the case was finally closed.

PLEAS OF THE ATTORNEYS.

District Attorney Meyer opened for the Commonwealth in the final summing up, congratulating the jury upon the fact that the long and tedious trial was drawing to an end, and commending them for the patient attention with which they had listened to its details. Commenting upon their responsible position as judges of the guilt or innocence of the prisoner, he indulged in general remarks on the gravity of the offense that had been submitted to their judgment. The case was dependent upon circumstantial evidence, but that kind of evidence is frequently of the most conclusive character. He read some extracts from books of authority on the subject, showing the weight and nature of the circumstantial evidence introduced by the Commonwealth. From this evidence there could be no other conclusion than that Clara Price had been murdered by Alfred Andrews. The defense had entirely failed to shift the responsibility of this great crime to other shoulders. The attempt to prove that John Gaines was there was a failure. The testimony clearly proved that John Gaines had no connection with the foul crime. It was proved by Mrs. Watson that Andrews was so close on the tracks of Clara Price going down the road that if he did not kill her he must have seen the man who did, and heard the shots. There can be no other deduction; yet in spite of such a necessity of logic Andrews says he wasn't there, but turned off the road. Andrews made his appearance at the log job afterwards, and those who followed the foot prints leading from the scene of the murder came out also at the log job. There is inconsistency throughout his statements. There was a confusion in his conduct that indicated that he was disturbed by his guilt. He claimed to be after work and yet did not hunt for a job; he asked where Karthaus was and yet had lived there for several years; he said he was going to Karthaus and yet did not try to get there. He did not stop to get dinner, but hurried home rapidly. With regard to the blood on his shoes, the testimony of an expert is that it was human blood and not the blood of a chicken as pretended by the defense. There is evidence that when the chicken was killed that it claimed to have produced that blood Andrews did not have those shoes upon his feet. Mr. Meyer continued a train of very forcible argument, showing his ability to handle the most intricate points of evidence, closing with an appeal that justice should be meted to the murderer of Clara Price.

MR. CHAMBERS' ARGUMENT.

The opening argument on the part of the defense was made by Mr. Chambers. He spoke of the unreliable character of circumstantial evidence. This entire case hinged upon three facts: that Albert Andrews was on the road that day when the murder had been committed; that his shoes fit the tracks in the road, and that there was blood on his shoes when found. No motive for the crime appears but lust, but there was nothing in the prisoner's character as proved that indicated such a disposition. There was evidence that the blood on his shoes was chicken blood. The prisoner had started to go to Lock Haven but decided to go to Karthaus; when near Karthaus he walked over to Giltenton. At 9 o'clock he was seen at the little bridge near the school house by Herbert Bates. Mrs. Watson says she saw him at 9.30 over four

miles away from the school house. This was a physical impossibility, as no man can walk four miles in half an hour. Mr. Chambers continued a strong line of argument for nearly an hour, probing the weak points in the case of the prosecution.

ARGUMENT OF MR. SPANGLER.

The defense was then taken up and continued by Col. Spangler in a strong and brilliant strain of argument. He claimed that the offense which had been submitted to the investigation and judgment of the jury must be either murder in the first degree or nothing. In regard to the evidence he said that Fitts and Smith from across the river testified that they heard the shots at about 10 o'clock a. m., and the testimony of Oswalt was that he found the body in the road at 11 or half past 11, and that it was cold. The conclusion must be that the murder was committed at ten minutes to 10 a. m. After the discovery of the body the number of persons who visited it and surrounded it was large. There must have been ten persons who gathered around the body in order to recognize it before Esq. Rankin came. With all these innumerable tracks intermingled together an attempt was made to identify and measure the track of the person who had committed the crime. According to testimony given by Commonwealth there were tracks going up the road intermingled with those of Clara Price, and the tracks of the latter left the road on the left of the body and a few feet from it; but according to the testimony of the bullet hole in Clara Price's hat she was turning around to run up the road and the bullet came from the right hand side of the road while she was on the left hand side. From all reliable appearances there was no scuffle, yet in the face of this fact the Commonwealth tries to make it appear that there was an attempt to ravish the victim. Such an attempt upon a girl a strong and muscular as Clara Price was, must have resulted in a scuffle in which she would naturally have tried to defend herself with her basket instead of allowing it remain on her arm where it was when her body was found, without any disarrangement of her hair or clothing. If the blood on the shoes was from the victim, there must have been a scuffle, with blood flowing from the wounds, of which there is not the slightest evidence. In the absence of any such an encounter could there not have been an assassin, lying in wait for his victim and shooting her from a concealed position, the ball penetrating her hat and glancing to her basket.

Mr. Spangler then showed up the unreliability of circumstantial evidence, giving cases where through such evidence gross injustice had been done and innocent parties been made to suffer. In giving such evidence consideration juries should be careful that the connections are all right and every link in the chain strong enough to stand the strain of investigation. The evidence of the shoes was based upon the hypothesis that the tracks might have been made by them. The evidence that they were made by them was by no means clear. Upon this point the testimony of witnesses did not agree. He criticised the preciseness as to the time that Clara Price was alleged to have been seen at certain points along the road, some of the witnesses actually bringing their recollection down so fine as to speak of minutes, but in the preliminary examination they did not venture upon such precision and did not mention minutes. He traced the points of time at which Clara Price passed the houses along the road, and then asked where Alfred Andrews was at this time? It was over 5 miles from Mrs. Croft's where Andrews started that morning, to where the body was found. Bates says that Andrews passed him at 9 o'clock within a half mile of Croft's. Mrs. Michaels says that Clara Price was passing her house at that time. Hence Clara Price at that pivotal point in the transaction was 4 1/2 miles from Andrews. Can it be believed that the prisoner gained those 4 1/2 miles in less than 30 minutes? Mr. Spangler then spoke of the manner in which Andrews left home, intending to go to Lock Haven for some money due him, but hearing of a lumber job near Karthaus, changed his mind and thought he would get work at the lumber job. He had not the slightest knowledge or thought that Clara Price would be on the road or anywhere else on the line of his travel. Why did he go a mile out of his way from Summit to Giltenton and then back to the pike? Did he think Clara Price was at Giltenton? Was there any evidence of guilt in his going there? His saying that he was going to Karthaus was only conditional on his getting work. It indicated no intention to commit murder. Did the prisoner act like a guilty man when he went straight to the men in the woods and asked them for work? He could have avoided them by going to the right or to the left of them. He could have taken the river path and followed it out. It would have been his object to avoid every person in the neighborhood. But when he went and asked